

The Effectiveness of Online Learning on the Level of Understanding of International Course Material

Mohzana¹, Murcahyanto^{2*}, Hartini Haritani³

^{1,2}*Faculty of Language, Art, and Humanity, Universitas Hamzanwadi, Selong, Indonesia

³Faculty of Health, Universitas Hamzanwadi, Selong, Indonesia

*Corresponding Author. Email: harymurcahyanto@gmail.com

Abstract: This research aims to evaluate the effectiveness of online learning in achieving educational goals through understanding the material of international course subjects. A descriptive qualitative approach was employed, involving 87 students as research participants. Data collection techniques included questionnaires, interviews, and tests to measure students' understanding of international course materials. The results indicate that online learning effectiveness was rated as good based on an average questionnaire score of 55.25. Meanwhile, test results showed that 50.57% of students had a good understanding of the material, while 48.27% were below the proficient level. Thus, online learning is considered effective in enhancing understanding of international course materials. These findings highlight the importance of integrating technology in the learning process to achieve educational goals effectively.

Article History

Received: 27-02-2024

Revised: 29-02-2024

Published: 30-03-2023

Key Words:

Efectivity,
Online learning,
Understanding.

How to Cite: Mohzana, M., Murcahyanto, H., & Haritani, H. (2024). The Effectiveness of Online Learning on the Level of Understanding of International Course Material. *IJE : Interdisciplinary Journal of Education*, 2(1), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.61277/ije.v2i1.80>



<https://doi.org/10.61277/ije.v2i1.80>

This is an open-access article under the CC-BY-SA License.



Introduction

When the world was confronted with the presence of Coronavirus Disease (Covid-19) which was first detected in Wuhan, China, and declared a pandemic by the World Health Organisation (WHO) on 11 March 2020, it had a significant impact. Covid-19 is a type of virus that attacks the human respiratory system and is transmitted through saliva droplets. One of the countries affected by this pandemic is Indonesia, which is experiencing major changes in various aspects of human life (Nafrin & Hudaiddah, 2021; Olivia et al., 2020; Ophinni et al., 2020).

One of the sectors significantly impacted by the Covid-19 pandemic is education (Cahaya et al., 2022; Hidayat et al., 2020). Education is considered a fundamental right that every individual must fulfil. The presence of this virus has changed the educational landscape, prompting the government to take certain actions. One of these measures was taken by the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture, which issued Circular Letter No. 4 of 2020, regulating the implementation of education policies in the face of the Corona Virus Disease (Covid-19) emergency. This policy involves school closures and shifting the learning

process from face-to-face to distance learning (online) at home (Dewi & Sadjiarto, 2021; Ismail & Alexandro, 2021; Sadikin & Hamidah, 2020; Yudhira, 2021).

Online learning or often called Learning Management System (LMS) is an effort made by an educational institution to manage the design and implementation of learning systems, as well as evaluate the learning process and results electronically (Bradley, 2020; Y. Fitriani, 2020; Prasetyo et al., 2021; Rahman et al., 2019; Shurygin & Sabirova, 2017). The purpose of online learning is to fulfil educational standards by utilising information technology, which allows interaction between students and lecturers through computer devices or gadgets connected to the internet (Bovermann et al., 2018; Guo et al., 2018; Murcahyanto, 2023b, 2023a). This technology allows students and lecturers to stay connected so that the process of transferring knowledge from lecturers to students can continue.

However, the adoption of this online learning system is not always smooth. The government's policy in supporting online learning makes some schools or institutions feel unprepared, as it requires access to online learning media such as laptops, mobile phones, and a stable internet connection. Educators must ensure that the teaching and learning process continues to run smoothly, even though students study from home. Lecturers are required to be innovative in designing learning by utilising various online media available.

Various educational institutions have adopted this online learning system to support learning activities. Online learning is conducted through personal computer (PC) or laptop devices and gadgets connected to the internet network. Lecturers can conduct online learning activities through various available platforms, such as social media like YouTube, Google Classroom, e-learning, WhatsApp, Zoom Meeting, and so on (Heliawati et al., 2021; Kurni & Saritha, 2021; Maharani et al., 2021; Rahmatika et al., 2021).

Universities have provided facilities for all students to support online learning, such as UKT fee exemption, 15 GB free internet quota allocation every month, and providing Learning Management System (LMS). Online learning is a learning system that does not involve face-to-face meetings between lecturers and students, but is conducted online through the internet network. Thus, lecturers can ensure that students can follow the learning simultaneously, even though they are in different locations (Oktavian & Aldya, 2020; Suhatmi et al., 2021; Sumilat et al., 2022; Suryanti, 2021).

Learning is a process of direct interaction between learners and the environment, which aims to produce positive behavioural changes. The learning approach emphasises more on the process, which is how the educator or lecturer plans, organises, and arranges the material so that it can arouse the motivation of students to understand the material being taught. In face-to-face learning, the interaction between educators and learners allows a more active exchange of learning experiences, because both parties are in the same room, allowing the learning process to run smoothly and comfortably (W. Fitriani et al., 2020; Nurdyansyah, 2019; Priansa, 2017; Suryana, 2013).

International courses are an integral part of the study programme. The learning process of international courses will be more effective if students exchange understanding in discussing the material taught. Effectiveness is a measure of the extent to which targets (both in terms of quality, quantity, and time) have been achieved. The higher the percentage of targets achieved, the higher the effectiveness.

However, the effectiveness of online learning is often debated due to the lack of control between lecturers and students, so the success of online learning is still in doubt. Learning

effectiveness is a learning process that provides benefits to learners, enabling them to acquire skills, knowledge and attitudes in an easy, enjoyable way, and achieve learning objectives as expected. Each course has fundamentally different learning objectives.

However, the general purpose of learning is for students to be able to know, understand, analyse, and implement the material that has been taught. Understanding the material taught by an educator is one of the main goals in education, as this understanding is considered an absolute prerequisite in cognitive theory.

In the context of this research, to measure the effectiveness of online learning in international courses, students' understanding of the material is the main indicator. Students are considered to understand the material if they are able to provide detailed explanations and descriptions using their own words.

Learning through online media is considered to provide less real experience to students, making it difficult for them to understand the material in the long run. In online learning, they tend to only read the material before performing, in contrast to face-to-face learning where students are required to be thoroughly prepared when performing in front of the class. This causes the time needed for understanding the material to be longer. Therefore, international economics course is chosen as the focus of this research, to explore the challenges faced by students in participating in online learning. The subjects of this research are students as the recipients of learning.

Some of the obstacles faced by students in online learning include: Unstable internet prices during online learning. Unstable internet networks, disrupting the smooth running of online learning. Difficulty in understanding learning materials which makes them feel they are not getting enough knowledge from online learning. Difficulty in learning independently, because they are not used to this method.

During face-to-face learning, students receive materials directly from lecturers in class, and they have the opportunity to ask questions and discuss freely. However, in online learning, students are required to learn independently from home, find their own materials and references and understand the material themselves. Although students can ask questions online, time constraints and limited interaction make this method less effective. This causes students' lack of enthusiasm and motivation to learn, as well as the lack of knowledge they feel they have gained from online learning.

Research Method

This research uses a qualitative approach with descriptive methods. The research was conducted at Hamzanwadi University during a 6-month period. The research subjects consisted of 87 students who were divided into three classes, namely 29 students from class A, 32 students from class B, and 26 students from class C, so that the total sample used was 87 respondents. The data collection technique was carried out through distributing questionnaires online using Google Form. The questionnaire was closed-ended with a Likert scale of 1-5 and consisted of 15 questions about learning effectiveness, as well as 10 test questions related to international course materials. In addition, data collection techniques also included interviews and documentation. Data validity was obtained through source triangulation and technique triangulation.

Data analysis was conducted through three stages, namely data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The data reduction stage involved collecting and

selecting relevant data for the research. Then, the data was presented in detail and structured in the data presentation stage. Finally, conclusions were drawn based on the data analysis that had been conducted, including the findings and interpretation of the research results to answer the research questions and achieve the research objectives.

Result and Discussion

a. Learning Effectiveness on Each Indicator in General

The results of the grouping of learning effectiveness on each indicator in general can be seen in table 1.

Table 1. Data Distribution of Online Learning Effectiveness Presentations

Num	Score Interval	Category	Frequency	Percentage
1	56,9-75	Very good	41	47,12%
2	52-56,8	Good	22	25,28%
3	40-51	Enough	22	25,28%
4	33,3-39	Not enough	2	2,29%
5	15-33,2	Not Good	0	0
Total			87	100%

Based on table 1 shows that the effectiveness of online learning can be seen from 87 students that there are 41 (47.12%) students in the very good category, 22 (25.28%) students in the good category, 22 (25.28%) students in the sufficient category, 2 (2.29%) students in the less category and 0 students who are in the bad category. this can be seen from several indicators such as learning quality, learning suitability, intensive, and time.

Indicators regarding the effectiveness of online learning in international courses can be seen from several tables below:

Table 2. Category of Online Learning Effectiveness in Each Indicator in General

Num	Indicator	Value	Category
1	Quality of learning	53,63	Good
2	Suitability of learning level	46,79	Enough
3	Incentive	66,42	Very good
4	Periode	54,16	Good
Mean		55,25	Good

Based on table 2, it shows that the effectiveness of online learning on the whole (all indicators contained in the effectiveness of learning) in the good category. the acquisition of the average value on each indicator shows that only one indicator is in the sufficient category, namely the suitability indicator in learning. While the other two indicators are in the sufficient category and 1 indicator in the excellent category.

Table 3. Effectiveness of Online Learning in International Courses at Every Grade Level

Num	Indicator	Class		
		A	B	C
1	Quality of learning	53,32	58,91	46,66
2	Suitability of learning level	46,57	52,92	40,90
3	Incentive	65,00	71,6	62,66
4	Periode	53,00	62,5	47,00
	Mean	54,47	61,48	49,30
	Category	Good	Good	Enough

Based on table 3 shows that the effectiveness of student online learning in international economics subjects is seen that there are 2 classes that are in the good indicator and 1 class that is in the sufficient category. The highest to lowest average acquisition is class B, A, C.

b. The Effectiveness of Online Learning Can Be Seen on Learning Quality Indicators

The results of the calculation of learning effectiveness on learning quality indicators in international courses can be seen in Table 4.

Table 4. Learning Quality Indicators

Num	Class	Value	Category
1	A	53,32	Good
2	B	58,91	Good
3	C	48,66	Enough
	Mean	53,63	Good

Table 4 shows that the quality of learning at grade level is in the good category. When the grade levels obtained different average scores and only one class C was still in the sufficient category.

c. Effectiveness of Online Learning Can Be Seen in Indicators of learning level suitability

The results of the calculation of the effectiveness of student online learning on the learning level suitability indicator in international economics courses can be seen in table 5.

Table 5. Learning Level Suitability Indicator

Num	Class	Value	Category
1	A	46,57	Enough
2	B	52,92	Good
3	C	40,90	Enough
	Mean	46,79	Enough

Table 5 shows that the effectiveness of student learning on the indicator of the suitability of the level of learning in international economics courses as a whole is still in the

sufficient category. The three grade levels obtained different average scores and only class B was already in the good category.

d. The Effectiveness of Online Learning Can Be Seen on Incentive Indicators Result and Discussion

The results of the calculation of the effectiveness of student learning on incentive indicators in international economics courses can be seen in 6.

Table 6. Incentive Indicators

Num	Class	Value	Category
1	A	65,00	Very good
2	B	71,6	Very good
3	C	62,66	Good
Mean		66,42	Very good

Table 6 shows that the effectiveness of student learning on incentive indicators in international economics courses as a whole is in the very good category. All three grade levels obtained very good average scores and only class C was still in the good category.

e. The effectiveness of online learning can be seen in time indicators

The results of the calculation of the effectiveness of student online learning on time indicators in international courses can be seen in Table 7.

Table 7. Indicators in Terms of Time

Num	Class	Value	Category
1	A	53,00	Good
2	B	62,5	Good
3	C	47,00	Enough
Mean		54,16	Good

Table 7 shows that the effectiveness of student learning on indicators in international courses as a whole is in the good category. The three grade levels obtained different average scores and only class C was still in the sufficient category.

f. Understanding of International Course Materials

Test data to determine the level of understanding of international economic course material if students can answer all questions correctly then the total score is 10 and the value is 100 because each question answered correctly will get a value of 1 and for students who answer incorrectly then the value will be obtained 0. After the analysis is done, it can be seen that the average student gets the value of the test results that have been done is 69.43. Of the 87 students, there are 10 students who get the highest score of 100 and 1 student who gets the lowest score of 10.

The frequency distribution is compiled to determine the number of respondents in a certain range of values. The frequency distribution of international course material understanding in students can be seen in table 8.

Table 8. Distribution of International Material Comprehension Test Results

Num	Value range	Frequency	Percentage
1	10 – 22	7	8,04%
2	23 – 35	5	5,74%
3	36 – 48	8	9,19%
4	49 – 61	24	27,58%
5	62 – 74	12	13,79%
6	75 – 87	17	19,54%
7	88 – 100	14	16,09%
N		87	100%

Based on Table 8, it is known that the frequency of tests of understanding of international economic material lies in the range of scores 49 - 61 as many as 24 respondents (27.58%) then followed by the range of scores 75-87 as many as 17 respondents, while the smallest frequency in the range of scores 23-35 as many as 5 respondents (5.74%).

Then from some of the points that have been obtained by students, the level of understanding is then determined, the determination of the level of understanding is based on the results of the international economic question test, the determination guidelines are taken from the predicate level of the value quoted from Fatimah Ibtisam on his website <https://rencanamu.id/post/jurusan-dan-perkuliahannya-serba-serbi-ip-ipk-dan-sistem-nilai-diperlukan-tinggi>, among others: 80-85 and above = A, (very understand), 65- 79 = B (understand), 50-64 = C (understand enough), 40-49 = D, (less understand), 40 and below = E (do not understand).

Table 9. Results of multiple choice test scores from 78 respondents

Num	Value	Amount	Total	Criteria
1	100	10		
2	90	4	31	A
3	80	17		
4	70	12	13	B
5	60	13		
6	50	11	24	C
7	40	8	7	D
8	30	5		
9	20	6	11	E
10	10	1		
Amount		87		

Based on table 9 measured through a test of 10 multiple choice questions on international courses that have been prepared, 31 students are at level (A) very understand, 13 students are at level B (understand), 24 students are at level C (understand enough), 7 students are at level D (less understand), and 11 students are at level E (do not understand).

Learning effectiveness can be measured through the quality of learning according to Slavin (Pranseyapri, 2018), namely how much information content is presented so that

students easily learn or the error rate is getting smaller. The smaller the error rate, the more effective the learning. Determination of the level of learning can be seen from the achievement of certain learning objectives. based on the results of research that has been obtained using a questionnaire, the overall percentage shows that the quality of online learning is categorised as good with the acquisition of 53.63%.

The quality of learning can be seen from the learning outcomes that have been obtained by students during the learning process in international courses from 87 respondents, 82 students received A grades, while 5 students received B grades. From these results, online learning shows an effective value of quality indicators as shown by student grades in international courses.

Furthermore, the results of this study are in accordance with Slavin's theory (Pransetyapri, 2018) that the effectiveness of learning can be measured through the suitability of the level of learning, namely the extent to which the lecturer can ensure the level of learning readiness of students. To see the level of teaching in this study using a questionnaire, the overall presentation shows that the level of learning is categorised as quite effective with an overall average score of 46.79%, which means that students are quite effective in carrying out the online learning process.]

Furthermore, the effectiveness of learning can be measured in terms of intense indicators in accordance with Slavin's theory (Pransetyapri, 2018), namely how much effort the lecturer makes to motivate students to complete or do tasks and learn the material provided. The greater the motivation given, the greater the effectiveness of students, thus learning will be effective. to assess the level of intensive in this study through the use of questionnaires, the overall percentage shows that intensive indicators in online-based learning for students are in a very good category by obtaining an overall average value of 66.42%. From these results, online learning shows the effective value of the intensive indicators shown from the students' scores in international courses.

Then the effectiveness of learning can be measured in terms of time indicators according to Slavin (Pransetyapri, 2018), namely the time needed to complete learning activities. Learning is said to be effective if students can complete learning in accordance with the time specified. To assess the intensive level in this study through the use of questionnaires, the overall percentage shows that the intensive indicators in online-based learning for students are very good categories by obtaining an overall average value of 66.42%. From these results, online learning shows effective value in terms of time that has been shown from the specified time.

To measure the effectiveness of online learning, measured through the level of understanding of the material, researchers have made 10 multiple choice questions using google form that will be answered by students. The results of the international material understanding test, show that out of 10 questions if students answer the questions correctly, the total score is 10 and the value is 100 because each question answered incorrectly gets a value of 0.

Of the 87 respondents measured through a test of 10 multiple choice questions in the international economics course that has been prepared, 31 students are at level (A) very understand, 13 students are at level B (understand), 24 students are at level C (understand enough), 7 students are at level D (less understand), and 11 students are at level E (do not understand). from the above results show that the average value of the test results of students

who are at the level of less understanding is 48.27% while the average value of the test results of students who are at the level of understanding is 50.57%. from these results online learning in international courses is considered to provide maximum value measured from the understanding of the material 78 students become participants in this study. From these results, online learning learning in international courses is considered to provide maximum value as measured by the understanding of material 78 students participated in this study.

Conclusion

Based on the results of research and wetting from data collection which is the focus of the problem in this study regarding the effectiveness of online learning on the level of understanding of international course material previously described, it can be concluded that of the four indicators consisting of learning quality, suitability of learning levels, intensity and in terms of time are in the good category which is able to have a considerable influence on understanding learning material. Data obtained by researchers that of the 87 students 50.57%, students are at the level of understanding and 48.27% are below the level of understanding. It can be concluded that learning carried out in online learning on the level of understanding of material in international courses is said to be effective.

References

Bovermann, K., Weidlich, J., & Bastiaens, T. (2018). Online learning readiness and attitudes towards gaming in gamified online learning—a mixed methods case study. *International Journal of Educational Technology in Higher Education*, 15(1), 1–17.

Bradley, V. M. (2020). Learning Management System (LMS) Use with Online Instruction. *International Journal of Technology in Education*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.46328/ijte.36>

Cahaya, A., Yusriadi, Y., & Gheisari, A. (2022). Transformation of the Education Sector during the COVID-19 Pandemic in Indonesia. *Education Research International*, 2022, 1–8.

Dewi, T. A. P., & Sadjiarto, A. (2021). Pelaksanaan Pembelajaran Daring Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 5(4). <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v5i4.1094>

Fitriani, W., Haryanto, H., & Atmojo, S. E. (2020). Motivasi Berprestasi dan Kemandirian Belajar Mahasiswa saat Pembelajaran Daring. *Jurnal Pendidikan: Teori, Penelitian, Dan Pengembangan*, 5(6). <https://doi.org/10.17977/jptpp.v5i6.13639>

Fitriani, Y. (2020). Analisa Pemanfaatan Learning Management System (LMS) Sebagai Media Pembelajaran Online Selama Pandemi Covid-19. *Journal of Information System, Informatics and Computing*, 4(2). <https://doi.org/10.52362/jisicom.v4i2.312>

Guo, R., Shen, Y., & Li, L. (2018). Using social media to improve student-instructor communication in an online learning environment. *International Journal of Information and Communication Technology Education (IJICTE)*, 14(1), 33–43.

Heliawati, L., Afakillah, I. I., & Pursitasari, I. D. (2021). Creative Problem-Solving Learning through Open-Ended Experiment for Students' Understanding and Scientific Work Using Online Learning. *International Journal of Instruction*, 14(4), 321–336.

Hidayat, D., Anisti, P., & Wibawa, D. (2020). Crisis management and communication experience in education during the covid-19 pandemic in indonesia. *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication*, 36(3), 67–82.

Ismail, M. N., & Alexandro, R. (2021). Pemanfaatan Media Pembelajaran Online Di Saat Pandemi Covid-19. *Jurnal Ilmiah Kanderang Tingang*, 12(1). <https://doi.org/10.37304/jikt.v12i1.112>

Kurni, M., & Saritha, K. (2021). Applying Collaborative Learning for Enhancing the Teaching-Learning Process in Online Learning through Social Media. *International Journal of Emerging Technologies in Learning*, 16(16). <https://doi.org/10.3991/ijet.v16i16.23207>

Maharani, E. N., Kusuma, A., & Murjiyah, T. (2021). Students' Perception of Using WhatsApp during Online Learning. *Tamansiswa International Journal in Education and Science*, 3(1). <https://doi.org/10.30738/tijes.v3i1.11285>

Murcahyanto, H. (2023a). Pengaruh Learning Management Sistem terhadap Motivasi dan Tingkat Kepuasan Mahasiswa pada Masa Pandemik Covid-19. *Journal of Education and Instruction (JOEAI)*, 6(1), 112–127.

Murcahyanto, H. (2023b). Penggunaan Media Whatsapp pada Pembelajaran serta Pengaruhnya terhadap Motivasi dan Gaya Belajar Siswa Selama Pandemi Covid-19. *Journal of Elementary School (JOES)*, 6(1), 13–30.

Nafrin, I. A., & Hudaidah, H. (2021). Perkembangan pendidikan Indonesia di masa pandemi COVID-19. *Edukatif: Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 3(2), 456–462.

Nurdyansyah, N. (2019). Media Pembelajaran Inovatif. In *Media Pembelajaran Inovatif*. <https://doi.org/10.21070/2019/978-602-5914-71-3>

Oktavian, R., & Aldya, R. F. (2020). Efektivitas Pembelajaran Daring Terintegrasi di Era Pendidikan 4.0. *Didaktis: Jurnal Pendidikan Dan Ilmu Pengetahuan*, 20(2). <https://doi.org/10.30651/didaktis.v20i2.4763>

Olivia, S., Gibson, J., & Nasrudin, R. an. (2020). Indonesia in the Time of Covid-19. *Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies*, 56(2), 143–174.

Ophinni, Y., Hasibuan, A. S., Widhani, A., Maria, S., Koesnoe, S., Yunihastuti, E., Karjadi, T. H., Rengganis, I., & Djauzi, S. (2020). COVID-19 vaccines: Current status and implication for use in Indonesia. *Acta Medica Indonesiana*, 52(4), 388.

Prasetyo, T., Marini, A., & Sumantri, M. S. (2021). Kepercayaan Dan Kepuasan Penggunaan LMS Mahasiswa Selama Pembelajaran Daring. *Jurnal Penjaminan Mutu*, 7(2).

Priansa, D. J. (2017). *Pengembangan Strategi & Model Pembelajaran: Inovatif, Kreatif, Dan Prestatif Dalam Memahami Peserta Didik*.

Rahman, M., Daud, M. Y., & Ensimau, N. K. (2019). Learning Management System (LMS) in Teaching and Learning. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 9(11). <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v9-i11/6717>

Rahmatika, R., Yusuf, M., & Agung, L. (2021). The Effectiveness of Youtube as an Online Learning Media. *Journal of Education Technology*, 5(1). <https://doi.org/10.23887/jet.v5i1.33628>

Sadikin, A., & Hamidah, A. (2020). Pembelajaran Daring di Tengah Wabah Covid-19. *BIODIK*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.22437/bio.v6i2.9759>

Shurygin, V. Y., & Sabirova, F. M. (2017). Particularities of blended learning implementation in teaching physics by means of LMS Moodle. *Revista Espacios*, 38(40).

Suhatmi, E. C., Lestari, R. D., & Sopingi, S. (2021). Pemanfaatan Teknologi Informasi dan Komunikasi dalam Pembelajaran Daring. *Remik*, 5(2). <https://doi.org/10.33395/remik.v5i2.11002>

Sumilat, J. M., Rorimpandey, W. H. F., & Siruru, S. (2022). Analisis Dampak Pembelajaran Daring Terhadap Hasil Belajar Siswa. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 6(5). <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i5.3739>

Suryanti, Y. (2021). Hubungan Pembelajaran Daring Terhadap Minat Belajar Siswa SMA. *Jurnal Educatio Fkip Unma*, 7(2), 477–481.

Suryana, D. (2013). Pengetahuan tentang strategi pembelajaran, sikap, dan motivasi guru. *Jurnal Ilmu Pendidikan*, 19(2).

Yudhira, A. (2021). Efektivitas Pembelajaran Daring Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19. *VALUE*, 2(1). <https://doi.org/10.36490/value.v2i1.177>